Highway Contractor



Public Facilities snowplow clears the roads northbound on the state's Glenn Highway.

There's a Toolkit for That

In this economy, spending money, even on something as vital as winter road maintenance programs, is a tough call for agencies because money is as hard to come by as it has ever been.

For the last 15 years, agencies have reduced budgets or have had budgets that remained flat, according to Clear Roads. Begun in early 2004, Clear Roads is a government-pooled fund project started in response to the need for real-world testing in the field of winter highway operations. Wisconsin DOT led this work from 2004 to 2009 under TPF-5(092). The Minnesota DOT now leads the project under TPF-5(218). The ongoing research program has 20 member states. Each of those states gives some of their research money to the Clear Roads project to help with ongoing research. In return, they reap the benefits of tools developed through research.

Better Roads June 2011 13

HighwayContractor

Cost-Benefit Toolkit

Phase 1:

- 1. Practices Anti-icing Deicing
- 2. Equipment
- **Carbide blades** Front plows
- **Underbody plows** Zero velocity spreaders

3. Operations

Maintenance Decision Support Systems (MDSS) Automatic Vehicle Location and Geographic Positioning Systems (AVL/GPS) Road Weather Information Systems (RWIS)

Mobile pavement temperature sensors

Mobile air/pavement temperature sensors

Phase 2

(The final list won't be determined until the project is underway)

- Comparing flexible blades to traditional blades 1. 2. Pre-treating prior to the storm
- Pre-wetting at the spreader
- 3. Slurries 4.
- 5.
- **Plow guards**
- Spreader calibration 6.
- Tow plows 7.
- Open vs. closed loop spreader controls 8.
- Laser guides 9.
- 10. Abrasives (sand/aggregates in different types or weights/ sizes)
- 11. Remote cameras for monitoring remote sites locations
- 12. Contracted truck (private or municipal) versus a stateowned truck
- 13. Tailgate vs. hopper spreaders

As a result of Phase One of the project that started last year [the "Cost-Benefit Analysis Toolkit" (Project Number: Clear Roads 08-02/WisDOT 0092-09-08)] state agencies are finding it easier to select and then to justify purchases and requests for services and purchases by having hard numbers to back them up.

This is critical in such tough economic times, says Paul Brown, director of snow and ice operations for Massachusetts and a project leader for the "Cost-Benefit Analysis Toolkit" research program. When the project began, the goal was to develop a practical tool, such as a spreadsheet or computer program, that could be used by Clear Roads states and other agencies to calculate the cost and benefits, and justify expenditures for specific new practices, equipment and operations.

The project team developed a user-

>>>

Highway Contractor

friendly, web-based tool that provides support for a cost-benefit analysis (based on available research) for 10 practices, equipment and operations. The tool is expandable, so it can include additional areas for analysis as needed. A training guide is also included.

When a new purchase has to have a cost-benefit analysis to justify its dollar value, it's essential to determine an effective method for determining the cost-benefit of incorporating new products and methods into an agency's operations.

But sometimes it's difficult to come up with accurate, hard numbers.

"The challenge is having all the information you need to describe what you need to do," says Brown. "You always have bits and pieces, but it's hard to get everything you need compiled." The cost-benefit tool does just that. It gathers all the pieces, puts it all in one place and does a sophisticated analysis so an agency is able to determine whether a decision would be a good investment or a bad investment, and how much an agency would gain or lose by making the decision.

"It takes the emotion out of purchasing decisions in snow and ice operations," Brown notes. "We often say that we need to have a certain piece of equipment and why we need it. But the toolkit allows us to say, 'If we put this on our truck, the rate of return is 'X' or that,

THERE'S MORE COVERAGE IN OUR DIGITAL EDITION! www.betterroads.com/digital



To get more in-depth information on the Clear Roads Cost-Benefit Analysis project, use your smartphone to scan this tag.

A Different Plow Blade

What happens when you mix ceramic and rubber in a snow plow blade? Go to our digitial edition and find out.



Salt II: Treated salt and brine are concepts gaining ground because they make it easier on your environment and your budget. Check out our digital edition story on our website or just scan this tag to see the full report. Maintenance Decision Support Systems are used in the Cost-Benefit Analysis Toolkit.

if we spend a dollar, we'll get \$3 back."

In essence, the cost-benefit tool allows an agency to "plug and play." A number is plugged in, crunched and an answer is provided. "The tool is outstanding," Brown says. (For a list of what factors are analyzed in Phase One of the Cost-Benefit Analysis Toolkit, see the sidebar, "Phase 1 of the Cost-Benefit Analysis Toolkit.")

Phase 2 has been approved for funding. What's more, the nation's top transportation leaders are on board, says Brown. In May, Brown talked to Transportation Secretary Ray LaHood and other transportation officials, and presented an argument why the toolkit is vital to state agencies, counties and municipalities.

"They agreed 100 percent with our proposal and understood that sometimes you have to spend money to save money," Brown explains. "You're not making up numbers and they are arranged in a way that makes sense. You have all the information, so you can justify budget, expenditures and the adjustments that go on your truck."

The "spend money to make money" premise is exactly what Annette Dunn, winter operations administrator for Iowa Department of Transportation's Office of Maintenance, used to get some needed equipment for her agency. By using the Clear Roads Cost-Benefit Analysis tool. Dunn was



able to justify an allocation for investment in an Automatic Vehicle Locator/Global Positioning System (AVL/GPS system).

"You need a baseline," says Dunn. "We need to be able to prove that we are costeffective while improving safety and overall effectiveness of winter operations."

For downloadable PDFs of the Clear Roads research on cost-benefit analysis, go to http://www.clearroads.org/researchprojects/08-02costbenefitanalysis.html or our shortened URL, http://tinyurl.com/ClearRoadsCostBenefitAnalysis